Measuring Mobility: Power, Autonomy, and Being Valued in Community

Hazel Markus | hmarkus@stanford.edu | @StanfordSPARQ | Davis-Brack Professor in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford University

Nisha Patel | nisha@urban.org | @heynisha | Executive Director, US Partnership on Mobility from Poverty
Webinar Housekeeping

- Webinar is being recorded
- Slides and recording will be sent out after the webcast
- All participants are muted
- Type your questions or comments into the Questions box on the right. Be sure to include your name and organization.

#MobilityFromPoverty
Nisha Patel  
nisha@urban.org | @heynisha  
Executive Director,  
US Partnership on Mobility from Poverty

Hazel Markus  
hmarkus@stanford.edu | @StanfordSPARQ  
Davis-Brack Professor in the Behavioral Sciences,  
Stanford University
The Partnership

David T. Ellwood, Chair
Harvard Kennedy School

Nisha G. Patel,
Executive Director

Elisabeth Babcock
Economic Mobility Pathways

Joshua Bolten
Business Roundtable

Arthur C. Brooks
American Enterprise Institute

William J. Bynum
Hope Enterprise Corporation

Raj Chetty
Stanford University

Rev. Luis Cortés, Jr.
Esperanza

Jennifer L. Eberhardt
Stanford University

Kathryn Edin
Princeton University

Robert Greenstein
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities

Cheryl L. Hyman
formerly City Colleges of Chicago

Anthony B. Iton
The California Endowment

Lawrence Katz
Harvard University

N. Gregory Mankiw
Harvard University

Ai-jen Poo
National Domestic Worker Alliance;
Caring Across Generations

john a. powell
Haas Institute for a Fair and Inclusive Society

Cecilia Rouse
Princeton University

Juan Salgado
City Colleges of Chicago

Eldar Shafir
Princeton University

Srinija Srinivasan
Loove

Marta Tienda
Princeton University

Jeremy Travis
Laura and John Arnold Foundation

Roxane White
The Aspen Institute

Hirokazu Yoshikawa
New York University
Mobility Definition

- Economic Success
- Being Valued in Community
- Power and Autonomy
Strategies

- Change the narrative
  - Create access to good jobs
  - Ensure zip code is not destiny
  - Provide support that empowers

Transform data use
Measuring Mobility from Poverty

Hazel Rose Markus
Gregory Acs, Amrita Maitreyi, Alana L. Conner, Sarah Lyons-Padilla, Nisha G. Patel, Jennifer L. Eberhardt
Overview

1. What is known about how low-income and poverty contexts influence psychological functioning
2. Measurement challenges
3. Measuring Power and Autonomy
4. Measuring Being Valued in Community
5. Measuring Mobility Toolkit
Poverty rates are unchanged since 1965
(US Census Bureau, 2014)

What can social psychology contribute?

• A fuller understanding of the psychological experience of poverty
• Ways to measure the psychology of people in low-income and poverty contexts
• Ideas and methods for increasing mobility from poverty
Less money, less education means

- Worse health, shorter lives
- More likely to experience trauma
- Often a target of negative stereotypes
- Work jobs with less choice and control
- Fewer choices, among fewer attractive options
- Interact more with family/long-time friends
- Teach children to fit in, observe hierarchy, follow norms
- More religious
- More empathy
- Give more
- More loyalty in relationships
- View self as strong, resilient
# Self-oriented psychological tendencies

(Markus & Stephens, 2017)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher-income contexts</th>
<th>Lower-income contexts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Prioritize the individual:  
  Expression of preferences, beliefs, choice, autonomy, standing out, norm challenging,  
• Focus on individual achievement  
• Higher self efficacy, self-esteem  
• Independent construal of self  
• Future-focus, planning  
• Promotion/growth motivation  
• Concern with control, influence, rights | • Prioritize relationships: Social responsiveness, fulfilling roles and responsibilities, norm following, fitting in  
• Less focus on individual achievement  
• Lower self efficacy, self-esteem  
• Interdependent construal of self  
• Present-focus  
• Prevention motivation  
• Concern with disrespect  
• Sensitivity to threat, exclusion |

## Other-oriented psychological tendencies

*(Markus & Stephens, 2017)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher-income contexts</th>
<th>Lower-income contexts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Loose networks of sociality</td>
<td>- Tight networks of sociality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Relationships as chosen</td>
<td>- Relationships as binding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Focus on change, development, planning, progress</td>
<td>- More empathy, compassion, prosocial behavior, loyalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Comparative advantage or role in maintaining inequality often unseen</td>
<td>- Less trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Outgroup derogation to justify advantaged position of ingroup</td>
<td>- Concern with reputation, honor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Less interest in redistribution</td>
<td>- Connection with place, tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- System justification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Outgroup derogation in response to low control/power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- More interest in economic redistribution</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Economic Success

Mobility

Being Valued in Community

Power and Autonomy
Researchers need reliable, valid, and culturally equivalent scales

- **Reliable**: Consistently measures a construct across components of the scale, population groups, and time.
- **Valid**: Accurately and completely measures the construct.
- **Culturally equivalent**: Reliably and validly measures the same construct in different cultural groups.
Scale selection for Americans with low incomes

• Does this capture what we want to measure?
• Has it been validated with people in low-income contexts?
• Does it predict outcomes for people in low-income contexts?
• Will participants understand the questions (e.g., reading level)?
Power and autonomy (agency)

- **Power**: A person’s ability to influence their environment, other people, and their own outcomes.

- **Autonomy**: A person’s capacity to act according to their own decisions.

- Measurements quantify what people are trying to do as well as situational constraints.
People everywhere need a sense of power, but what gives rise to power varies.

Necessary to consider the circumstances and contexts of people’s lives.
Sense of Control

• **Personal Mastery:**
  • “I can do just about anything I really set my mind to.”
  • “When I really want to do something, I usually find a way to succeed at it.”
  • “Whether or not I am able to get what I want is in my own hands.”
  • “What happens to me in the future mostly depends on me.”

• **Perceived Constraints:**
  • “There is little I can do to change the important things in my life.”
  • “I often feel helpless in dealing with the problems of life.”
  • “Other people determine most of what I can and cannot do.”
  • “What happens in my life is often beyond my control.”
  • “There are many things that interfere with what I want to do.”
  • “I have little control over the things that happen to me.”
  • “There is really no way I can solve the problems I have.”
  • “I sometimes feel I am being pushed around in my life.”

Lachman & Weaver, 1998
Sense of Control: Higher levels of **Personal Mastery** narrow the SES-health gap

Lachman & Weaver, 1998
Sense of Control: Lower levels of Perceived Constraints narrow the SES-health gap

Lachman & Weaver, 1998
Shift and Persist

• Measures two beneficial strategies for dealing with stressful situations:
  • *shifting*, which means accepting stress and adapting oneself to it
  • *persisting*, which means finding meaning and optimism in the face of adversity.
Shift and Persist

Shift:

When something stressful happens in your life...
   I think about what I can learn from the situation.
   I think about the positive aspects, or the good that can come from the situation.

When something doesn't turn out the way you want, and you are not able to change it...
   I think about what good things could come from the situation.
   I think about what I can learn from the situation.

Persist:

I feel my life has a sense of purpose.
My life feels worthwhile.
I believe there is a larger reason or purpose for my life.
I feel my life is going nowhere. (R)

Chen, McLean, & Miller, 2015
Shift and Persist

Low-SES children who have higher shift and persist scores have lower levels of inflammation (linked to multiple diseases) and lower BMIs

• No effects among high-SES children

• Positive health effects depend on the combination of shift and persist strategies

Chen et al., 2013; Ridker, Hennekens, Buring, & Rifai, 2000; Kallem et al., 2013
Being Valued in Community

• A person’s sense that they belong and are included among family, friends, coworkers, neighbors, other communities, and society.

• Measurements quantify:
  • a persons’ sense that they are valued in community and society, their social standing
  • barriers to belonging in community (e.g., perceived discrimination)
Belongingness – Sense of Fit

People at [work/community/school] accept me.

I fit in well at [work/community/school].

I am similar to the kind of people who succeed at [work/community/school].

I belong at [work/community/school].

I feel comfortable at [work/community/school].

If I wanted to, I could potentially do very well at [work/community/school].

Walton & Cohen, 2007
Providing a new narrative – “you belong here”: Reframing college struggles as normal, rather than a sign of not belonging, improves school performance

Walton & Cohen, 2011
Perceived Discrimination (Lifetime)

How many times in your life have you been discriminated against in each of the following ways because of such things as your race, ethnicity, gender, age, religion, physical appearance, sexual orientation, or other characteristics?

- “You were discouraged by a teacher or advisor from seeking higher education.”
- “You were not hired for a job.”
- “You were fired.”
- “You were prevented from renting or buying a home in the neighborhood you wanted.”
- “You were prevented from remaining in a neighborhood because neighbors made life so uncomfortable.”
- “You were hassled by the police.”
- “You were denied a bank loan.”
- “You were denied or provided inferior medical care.”
- “You were denied or provided inferior service by a plumber, care mechanic, or other service provider.”

MIDUS-II; Williams et al., 1997; Kessler, Mickelson, & Williams, 1999
Perceived Discrimination (Daily)

“You are treated with less courtesy than other people.”
“You are treated with less respect than other people.”
“You receive poorer service than other people at restaurants or stores.”
“People act as if they think you are not smart.”
“People act as if they are afraid of you.”
“People act as if they think you are dishonest.”
“People act as if they think you are not as good as they are.”
“You are called names or insulted.”
“You are threatened or harassed.”

MIDUS-II; Williams et al., 1997; Kessler, Mickelson, & Williams, 1999
Why America’s Black Mothers and Babies Are in a Life-or-Death Crisis

The answer to the disparity in death rates has everything to do with the lived experience of being a black woman in America.

By LINDA VILLAROSA APRIL 11, 2018
Women who report the most experiences of racism have higher levels of preterm birth.
Think of this ladder as representing where people stand in the United States.

At the **top** of the ladder are the people who are the best off - those who have the most money, the most education, and the most respected jobs. At the **bottom** are the people who are the worst off - who have the least money, least education, and the least respected jobs or no job. The higher up you are on this ladder, the closer you are to the people at the very top; the lower you are, the closer you are to the people at the very bottom.

**Where would you place yourself on this ladder?**
Please place a large “X” on the rung where you think you stand at this time in your life, relative to other people in the United States.

Adler et al., 2000; MacArthur Network on SES & Health
The MacArthur Scale of Subjective Social Status is better at predicting self-rated health than many objective measures.

Operario, Adler, & Williams, 2004; Ostrove et al., 2000
How to make a difference

• Measure power and autonomy & being valued in community – identify and use appropriate measurement scales
• Gather data before and after program or intervention and where possible, include a control group
• Communicate the results
Measuring Mobility from Poverty Toolkit Website

• Background on psychological constructs measured

• Complete and useable versions of all measures

• Instructions on how to implement measures and use the resulting data


What are your reactions and questions?

Type your questions or comments into the Questions box. Be sure to include your name and organization.

#MobilityFromPoverty
For further information

www.MobilityPartnership.org

#MobilityFromPoverty